
BUENOS AIRES – LAC DNS Forum
Friday, June 19, 2015 – 08:00 to 19:00
ICANN – Buenos Aires, Argentina

CAROLINA AGUERRE: Good morning, we will start with the meeting, so if you could please sit down.

Good morning, everybody. Thank you for being here today with us. I'm very pleased to be able to say that we are organizing the second LAC DNS forum, which is a collective effort by many organizations that are working in the region and who have interest in the development of issues related to the DNS in Latin America and the Caribbean.

At this opening session, we have representatives of the main organizations involved in the committee to develop the agenda. And we have the support of our local partner, CABASE, the Argentine Internet Association, whose representatives are here, so thank you, [inaudible]. So now I'm going to give the floor to them. We'll start from my far left to the right. First, I'll give the floor to Fadi Chehadé, CEO and Chairman of ICANN, who will make some welcoming remarks. Gracias, Fadi.

FADI CHEHADE: Buenos dias, buen dia. I don't know the difference, by the way. Some people tell me buenos dias; some say buen dia. Is there a big difference? Can someone? No?

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Same.

FADI CHEHADE: Same. Okay. Of course, my office is run by a Brazilian, so I also know how to say [bom dia] every morning to her, so. What a beautiful morning here for us to start activities in Latin America again. This is my second visit to Latin America in the last few weeks. I was with my colleague here, Oscar, in Lima for the LACNIC meeting.

A fantastic meeting, by the way. If any of you have not attended a LACNIC meeting, I encourage you to do so. Great group of people. It was an impressive meeting, Oscar. You had 500 registered people there. So, please do attend these meetings, because we are a family of organizations. I think ICANN sometimes appears to be a big organization and everybody focuses on ICANN, but we are just one of many, and it's important to appreciate that LACNIC, ICANN; of course, the national bodies, CBASE here in Argentina, LACTLD, all of us are a family of organizations.

This is the power of the multi-stakeholder model, in that we don't have one top organization with everybody under them. We don't. We are actually all equal, and we are all working together, and the transition from the US government is proving that we actually are partners because no one is over anyone. We are connected with agreements that strengthen our commitments to ICANN to LACNIC, LACNIC to ICANN, but we are not one organization. They have

members. We have a multi-stakeholder community. We work together. We share many community members. That's the power of the multi-stakeholder model in that I sometimes use the term polycentric or distributed, that we don't have a center, we have a polycentric model. And the most stable models in physics are polycentric models, but also in governance.

So I'm delighted that we're here today to start the second DNS forum in Latin America. The DNS forum has been, in my opinion, one of the biggest successes in our work because it was your idea, not our idea. It was an idea that came from the community. You came together and you decided this would be helpful in order to strengthen the DNS industry in your region. Right?

So this is a forum by you and for you, and it is not an ICANN forum. It is a forum of the family of organizations that work together very well to support you, and to make the DNS work in Latin America successful.

Now, the work of the DNS is globalized by some big companies. GoDaddy, for example, is a global company, and that's okay. Some elements of business are global. But a lot of the growth at GoDaddy today, if you watch them, is not necessarily in selling domain names. It's in providing services. It's in services. And you and I know that the best services are local services, services that understand the customer, understand the business.

And whilst GoDaddy may grow, and I wish them luck, they're a great company, and they can reach different parts of the world, that does

not preclude the need for local DNS industry to also strive and grow and become successful, and serve customers in a way that understands their needs locally.

So we are here to support you to do that in every way we can, and this forum today is designed for you so that we can achieve your goals and help you reach them.

One of the things I will talk about on Monday at the ICANN opening, the ceremony that we have on Monday, is the globalization part of ICANN. Some of you know that when I started at ICANN three years ago, we had most of our people in the “Northern Hemisphere Western world”. And to be quite honest, mostly in America.

And that’s okay because that’s where we were born, but it’s no longer okay. If we are to serve you well and serve the globe well, ICANN needs to reach the world. And therefore, our activities here in your region thanks to our efforts and our coordination with ISOC, with LACNIC, with all of you here at LACTLD, we work together with you to make sure we serve you well in this region.

We now have seven people – five people – in Latin America. In my opinion, not enough. We need more people in this region to support and to coordinate better, but we are committed to you. We are committed to bring ICANN locally so ICANN is not just this big American entity, but rather, a global entity at your service.

I think you will see on Monday when I share with you some of the things we’ve done and the plans we’re doing, that this is not just

words. When I was at IBM, we used to say there are three phases to globalization. The first is geographic. Because you can't say, "I'm in Latin America," and you're not even here. All of you know the story that when I started at ICANN, I asked, "Who is responsible for Latin America?" They said, "Rodrigo De La Parra." I said, "Great. Where is he?"

They said, "He's in Washington." I said, "What? What is he doing in Washington?" [inaudible], right? "And they asked the same," she says. So poor Rodrigo had to go explain to his wife that it's time to move back to Latin America. "She's still mad at me," he says, but they're now very happy in Mexico back at home. And we then started building our [inaudible] presence.

And then we moved to process, processes, systems, and people who understand local needs. It's not just about putting people in Latin America. It's also changing the way we work to serve Latin America. If all my lawyers who review your contracts are American lawyers sitting in California, and they don't understand your laws and your jurisdictional issues, it's very hard for us to say we're serving you.

So we are now in this phase – we're not done with this phase –which is the phase of changing the way we work so that it starts from the local understanding. And we are on the way with that.

And then the third and final phase is when we can all certify that, in a way, the ethos of ICANN has become a global ethos. In other words, the way we think. Even small things, when we schedule meetings that make sure that every Asian or Latin American has to wake up at 2:00

AM to talk to us, that doesn't give the sense that our ethos is global, right?

So I think this is the hardest to do, by the way. I think you can change. You can move people, as we did, you can change systems and processes and so on, and we're in the process of doing that. But ultimately, the real test, which may take some time, is when the point comes when we think and we behave with an understanding of you.

So I will leave you to do real work. This is I came to just say buenos dias to you, to welcome you to this meeting, to thank you for hosting us, to thank our partners for being such gracious partners, and you have our full support in every way we can. Not just materially, because sometimes ICANN is viewed as having more money, therefore, we need to be different.

No, money is the least important part. Partnership and good spirits and commitment is the most important part, and that's bigger than money, and we have that, and let's strengthen that. So thank you very much for welcoming me, Carolina, and all of you, thank you.

CAROLINA AGUERRE:

Thank you, Fadi. Fadi has talked on behalf of ICANN, one of the core organizers of this meeting. I haven't mentioned all of them. We are the organizers of this meeting. Facilitators are ICANN, ISOC, NIC Argentina, Public Interest Register, LACTLD, and LACNIC, and CABASE. So we are a group of organizations, as I said earlier on, and I really thank Fadi for his words.

Setting the framework about the DNS as a standard that has global consequences, but which has to be worked on at the local level, and this is what we are trying to achieve through this meeting. Thank you.

So now I give the word to Oscar Robles, CEO of LACNIC, who will share with us some welcoming remarks. Thank you, Oscar.

OSCAR ROBLES:

Thank you, Carolina. It's an honor for me to be here with you and I think this is an excellent opportunity because, despite our differences in soccer, which will become even bigger in the near future in these days, we may sit together on a friendly basis at this session.

As a matter of fact, this is an excuse so that we won't fight with so many foreigners present. Well, I think it's an extraordinary meeting because it is evidence of what we can do in the region as regional organizations. The fact is that we are here, several organizations from the region besides the local hosts, CABASE and NIC Argentina, and there is evidence to what we can do with a sensitive issue for our industry, the DNS, which is a system and [noble] element, which may work with very little resources, but which calls for a lot of expertise, knowledge, technical knowledge to make the fine tuning so that it will work properly.

So I think these meetings are important for the industry. I congratulate us, all the organizations who have organized this meeting, because we have to work hard on technical issues to raise the bar for the technical requirements, and to raise the bar for

technical training meetings in the region so that we will have a more stable, secure, and reliable Internet, and so that we can keep on having interactions and meetings, which will increase attendance.

So thank you very much for an invitation. I hope this is an excellent meeting.

CAROLINA AGUERRE: Thank you very much, Oscar, and now I give the floor to Eduardo Santoyo, Chairman of LACTLD.

EDUARDO SANTOYO: Good morning, Carolina. Good morning, everybody. Thank you for enabling us to be here today at this second LAC DNS Forum. And although [early on], we wanted to do something similar that had been done in Africa to concentrate efforts of local discussion of issues that are of interest to the industry, I think we have improved significantly and matured because of the features of our region.

Now we have a dialogue which is richer, attended by multiple stakeholders and groups that share responsibilities in the management and coordination of the resources that are important for Internet to work properly. We have had a really big advantage. We have had the support and the efforts of many organizations that operate in the region that are in the region, in the various areas related to Internet, and especially our friends of Public Internet Registry and the local ICANN office.

They all have helped us to create this room for dialogue and discussion. We expect, through this, to contribute and create areas and venues to develop more informed and better shaped opinion in Latin America about the various elements that make up the value chain in the construction of the Internet platform, so that we will improve and expand our involvement individually from our own organizations, and also, the organizations that work at the regional level so that, eventually, we will carry out the dialogue and participation process globally. Thank you very much to everybody.

We hope this will be a rich and participatory meeting. We hope there will be a lot of activity because this will make the meeting more interesting. I hope we'll have a chance to interact and network. Thank you very much.

CAROLINA AGUERRE:

Thank you, Eduardo. Now I will give the floor to Paul Diaz from the Public Interest Registry. Paul has just landed, so he has spent the whole night on a plane. So thank you very much for being here this early. Thank you very much, Paul.

PAUL DIAZ:

Thank you, Carolina. I'm still quite jetlagged. I prefer to do this in English. And actually, I just want to reiterate or underscore things that colleagues have already said. Public Interest Registry, of course, operating dot org, you all know for quite some time now. We make it

part of our mission to work with our colleagues in the various regions, [inaudible] from Middle East.

We've worked with the African DNS Forum, as well, and have been key supporters of this LAC DNS initiative now, the second running. We will continue to do so. We work very closely with all the regional groups. In fact, if I can hint at something that we are beginning to plan a year from September, so September of 2016, leadership of the various regional groups with Carolina is a very important lead in developing this.

We hope to do something like this, these forums, but more global perspective, so we will be inviting people to Washington, DC. We'll work with ISOC and all the various regional ccTLD groups as well as ICANN's regional VPs to develop this program. It's a long ways off, so the agenda is still to be determined, but at least to put that out there and to further underscore the importance, the power of collaboration and discussion, of working together. There are many common interests, common challenges, a lot of information, good knowledge that can be shared, so that we can all advance our missions.

And truly, that is part of what PIR is all about, so thank you for having us today, and we look forward to today's full agenda. Thank you.

CAROLINA AGUERRE:

Thank you very much, Paul. And now I give the floor to Sebastian Bellagamba, who is the Regional Chairman for ISOC in Latin America and the Caribbean.

SEBASTIAN BELLAGAMBA: Good morning, everybody, and thank you. Good morning from us, from the ISOC participating in this meeting as we participated two years ago in the first DNS Forum for Latin America and the Caribbean. It's a big honor and privilege, but it's important to understand that during these two years, many things have happened and will keep on happening.

Many of the things I was going to say have already been said by my colleagues, and I fully support what they have said and all the praises and thank yous. But I'd like to mention some of the things Fadi said about the way we have been working in the region and how we should keep on working.

Many of our organizations, as Fadi said, we believe we are family. We are sibling organizations working pursuing the same aim. That is to grow Internet in an open way, protecting its stability and security. We are all working for this. Meetings like this are very important. It's important to understand the DNS business to be able to make progress, move forward so that this business will enable more people to be connected so that we are all better connected that the basic Internet features that have been defined from the very beginning are still kept.

These are key components for our daily work, and that's why we're here. That's why the ISOC is here. This issue of working together where we see it in a very important [resale] because with the exception of the PIR, all the other organizations present here who

have organized this meeting are housed in the same venue in the region. I'd like to tell you about the Internet home in Latin America and the Caribbean, which used to be LACNIC's headquarters. I thank LACNIC for allowing us to be there, to work there, so we work there together every day cooperating together.

If I'm not wrong, we are eight organizations all in the same building—

[audio break]

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Here, of course, but we didn't have any registry of generic registry in Latin America. So with a new program, we now have 24 registries and there are some of them, which have already been delegated. But if we compare these 24 registry against the 2,000 applications that had been received, well, this does not represent the 10% that Latin America amounts to.

We have, in Latin America, 1,000 registries, and in the region, we only have 19. So that was an unbalanced situation, so we took some steps at a global level and at a regional level, with the idea of improving and promoting the industry and also focusing on these regions and areas, which has not been well served or represented in the past.

So the idea of this panel is to be able to know, to learn, what is being done at the global level. I have my partner here, my colleague here, and he's one of the chairs of this unit for the GDD, chaired by Akram Atallah, and he will speak about the global view of this topic.

And then, in order to learn about what is happening in other regions of the world, because they have very interesting projects, I have invited my colleague, Baher Esmat. He's the chair for the Middle East Region in ICANN and he will speak about their work there.

And then we will focus on regional Latin American experiences. We have certain projects that are being developed together with a community in order to replicate and to implement these initiatives in Latin America. We have here [Caro], Daniel and because they're working on a LACTLD project, and this is one of the projects that we are supporting in our LAC strategy. So Cyrus, welcome, thank you for being here, and I give you the floor.

CYRUS NAMAZI:

Gracias, Rodrigo. Buenos dias. Thank you very much, Rodrigo. And that pretty much exhausted my knowledge of Spanish, unfortunately, so I have to switch to English. What a beautiful day, what a beautiful city, Buenos Aires. Thank you for having us. And thank you, LAC DNS and LACNIC, for inviting me to this talk.

As Rodrigo said, I'm a member of ICANN's Global Domains Division, or GDD. GDD predominantly, in ICANN, is responsible for operating many of the services that ICANN offers to the community. So I wanted to spend a few minutes to talk to you about some of these initiatives, some of these programs that we've undertaken.

Fadi actually mentioned the globalization of ICANN and how much effort it takes, actually, to do that successfully, and you do that in

phases by hiring people in different regions, by scaling and managing your processes to be also sort of globalized and, of course, changing the mindset of people at ICANN, which two, three, four years ago, used to be predominantly North America focused to be a global organization.

So within GDD, there are several important initiatives that are undergoing. The most visible one, I suppose, is the New gTLD Program. Rodrigo mentioned some of the statistics of it related to the region here. But the New gTLD Program is one of the services that we operate within the Global Domains Division.

I'm happy to report to you that since 18 months ago or so, when we delegated the first new gTLD, [inaudible] actually, in Arabic, IDN TLD, we are now pretty close to having signed 1,000 new contracts with new applicants, of course, for new gTLDs, and we've had over 650 new gTLDs delegated into the root.

So that's a substantial, significant achievement, really, for us, for the community to having gone from, essentially, what used to be 22 generic top-level domains to now over nearly 700. And I think within the next 12 months or so, we will well surpass 1,000 or so. So a very significant undertaking for us.

Another part of what GDD offers as a service to the community, again, is that we're responsible for the definition, implementation, and maintenance of new policies and new services that come up through the bottoms-up multi-stakeholder model.

And last but not least, we also operate the customer service arm of ICANN, and that's another bit of the business that we've continued to grow and make sure that it's internalized and globalized. And soon, you actually will be able to contact ICANN in your own language, in your own time zone with the new services that will be unfolding very soon.

I already talked about the new gTLD program, what a monumental undertaking it's been for us. Another initiative that we're heavily involved in, actually, has to do with the universal acceptance of new gTLDs. I believe my colleague, Don Hollander, is going to give you a full overview of what's being done there.

The universal accepted of TLDs has to do, essentially, at a high level, with all services and systems being able to accept TLDs in their own scripts without any limitation and lack of functionality. This is extremely important to the success of the Internet on a global basis, again.

And ICANN has worked with the community to put together a volunteer group, a Universal Acceptance Steering Group, or UASG, which since the Singapore conference back in February, has been working hard to lay the foundation for, essentially, addressing this very global issue. It's a very complex issue. Like I said, Don is going to talk to you about this in much more detail in the next session.

Another undertaking that we're heavily involved is has to do with internationalized domain names, or IDNs. Of the about 1,900 applications that we received for the New gTLD Program, about 115

were for IDN, and of these, about 86 have actually been put into service, being delegated.

So this is another core area that we're investing heavily, not only the delegation of new gTLDs within IDN and non-ASCII scripts, but also being able to come up with the general rules and guidelines for being able to use IDNs, obviously, in any script and any language and their variants. It's another big project for us.

And, of course, we've also had the IDN ccTLD fast track program in place since 2009, and this is the program that actually allows the operators of country codes to be able to run their country codes in their own script. We've had a total of 29 of these already delegated from 37 that have been evaluated, and this process continues to go on.

Another important initiative within GDD, actually, has to do with the rollout of a subsequent round of new gTLD program, so the first round is pretty much in what we call autopilot mode, a lot of the systems have been put in place. We're on a systemic approach to signing contracts, delegating new gTLDs, but already, there is demand for a subsequent round to the New gTLD Program.

So part of what GDD is involved in is a series of reviews of what has happened that in the first round of New gTLD Program. You may have seen that we've conducted a number of surveys. We've actually published the results of it. That provides the baseline for us to be able to measure the impact of the new gTLD program on competition, consumer choice, consumer trust, and so on. And these are the

metrics that we need to be able to look at to go fine tune when we roll out the subsequent rounds of New gTLD Program.

These are some of the highlights of some of the services that we offer at GDD. Let me give the microphone back to Rodrigo and, of course, I'm hoping for a good, lively discussion later on. Thank you very much.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Thank you very much, Cyrus, for giving us this outlook when it comes to the [inaudible] at the regional and global level. So we will continue with this logic of having the general first and the particular then, and we will make the most of our colleague, Baher. He will speak about his experience regarding the implementation and promotion of projects in order to promote the DNS industry in the Middle East. Baher, you have the floor.

BAHER ESMAT:

Thank you, Rodrigo. Good morning, everyone. I'm Baher Esmat. I'm part of the ICANN's Global Stakeholder Engagement Team. I look after the Middle East region. I'm very pleased to be with you here this morning sharing some of the experiences we have in the Middle East, and actually those experiences we've been learning a lot from you guys, from the Latin American and Caribbean region, and we're kind of following you on some of your initiatives, as well.

I'm not sure I'm able to – okay, so you control the slides from there. Okay, good.

So I'm going to talk about two key projects that we're working on in the Middle East as part of the Middle East engagement strategy. So in the Latin American strategy, there are a number of strategic areas identified by community members. So in the Middle East, there was a group of 20-plus community members who worked on engagement strategy for ICANN in the Middle East, and they identified a number of key strategic areas where they thought that and they commanded that more work to be done in there.

One of those areas was the domain name industry, and developing the domain name industry across the Middle East, and there were specific sort of objectives with a clear set of KPIs identified by the strategy group. And two key projects that came out of this specific area, which I'm going to talk to you about today. One was the DNS Entrepreneurship Center and the other one was to conduct a DNS market study in the Middle East. Next slide please.

So the DNS Entrepreneurship Center, the idea came from discussions about building capacitors in the region in the various parts of the DNS ecosystem, technical business policy, and so forth. And there was a clear need for further development in this area, and to take the effort that, in fact, started years ago not only by ICANN but also the rest of the Internet community, from the Internet Society, the RIRs, and others in the capacity building tried to take this a step further and tried to not only build capacitors, but also deploy those capacitors in different projects and potential initiatives that may come out of the region.

And it was also obvious that this specific area is kind of common between the Middle East and Africa. So we started to think about this center to serve both regions and with the primary goal of developing the industry across both regions. Next slide, please.

The vision is for this center to become a repository for DNS knowledge and expertise in both regions, and in that, we're not saying or claiming that the center will be the only repository. It's a repository, and we are cognizant of the possibility and, actually, there are some initiatives in other parts of both regions that have similar objectives and there might be other similar initiatives in that regard. So it's one effort that ICANN together with other members of the community globally, regionally, are participating in. Yet, there might be other complementary efforts, as well. Next slide please.

As I said, the mission is to develop a robust industry ecosystem, and this, actually, when you look – we talk about DNS all the time because this is what we do, but the space is much larger than the DNS. Many of the challenges of that we might face in the DNS space actually, they have roots and reasons outside this space.

So just to give you an example in the Middle East, for instance, one of the key challenges we have is the lack of quality digital content. And with that we face a lot of challenges because we cannot talk about growing the number of domain names without having need for creating websites in the first place. So this is one challenge that we have in the Middle East.

Of course, as ICANN, we also realize that our mandate is limited to the DNS space. Yet, we're looking for partners from across the Internet ecosystem, whether policymakers, business, the content development community and so forth to try to see how our efforts can be complementary.

When I go and talk to the folks at Google in the Middle East, I met with them a couple of weeks ago in Dubai, and after five minutes of briefing them on what we do, the question was, "Do you guys doing other than domain names?" Then we started talking about, you know, but you do content because Google does a lot of effort in promoting the Arabic content in the region, as well. So the goal here is to try to find common areas where we can work together. Next slide, please.

So the project is about the DNS Center. Our main partner in this project is the Telecom Regulatory Authority of Egypt, which is also the registry of the IDN TLD of Egypt, .MASR. So we signed an MOU with the NTRA last year at the ICANN London meeting to set up this center and, as I said, to serve Africa and the Middle East.

It's a three-year project, and the plan is that the NTRA is going to incubate the Center during the first three years. And during this time, ICANN, together with partners from across the Internet community, will provide knowledge and expertise in areas related to DNS. And then, later on, after three years, the plan for this center is to sort of become independent.

We do not envisage a center of 50 people. I think that it's going to be a very lean sort of organization with few people, like full-time sort of staff. But at the same time, the Center is going to rely on resources from across the region that could be deployed in the various projects and activities. Next slide, please.

So as I said, it's a three-year project over three phases. Phase one is the foundation phase, which we started nine, ten months ago, and I'm going to talk about this in detail. And this is mainly sort of capacity building phase.

The second phase, which is about to start in a couple of weeks, this is the launching phase. And here, the center will start up its operation and will focus more during this year on developing a kind of business plan, and at the same time, will seek to participate with the resources it has so far in the different related activities in both regions, Middle East and Africa.

The third and final phase is the operational phase, where the Center should become sort of, as I said, independent entity and start to lend its services to projects and initiatives in the region. The Center, in the future, might also assume a DNS operational role. That is not yet finalized or materialized in terms of what exactly the Center can do in this space. It could be something related to operating DNS services in Egypt, for example. Next slide, please.

So we started training programs in the past six months under two main tracks, technical track and the business track. Technical track, that was more or less building on previous experience at ICANN

together with other Internet organizations has had over 10-15 years, so we're building on this experience.

The business track was kind of the new venture that we had to go through how to share experiences from across the DNS industry, and to bring those experiences to the Middle East, to Africa. And the reason that was a little bit challenging is that it's something that the business community, mainly registries and registrars in the G space, are not used to. But despite that, we got a few people that were very keen to participate and to help us get this initiative off the ground, and they participated with us in the first phase of this project. Next slide, please.

So we had a number of trainings so far. We had three training programs. I'm going to list them in the next slide. And for each one, we sort of had a public call for people who want to apply with a clear set of skills required for each training, so I'm not going to go through details of that. Next slide, please.

So we had two trainings under the business track – one on the DNS business development, and the other one on registry best practices – and then we had the trainer program under the technical track, and I'm listing or showing on the screen the list of partners that we had during this phase. I'd like to thank them all for the participation because without their participation and their volunteering in this project, it wouldn't have taken been off the ground.

And all the materials for the three trainings are available online, and we're also planning for a second technical training that will come up

during the last week of July on the DNS operations security, and the good news is that two of the students who participated in the train the trainer session back in April will be participating as co-trainers in this upcoming training. And this is the whole objective is to train people who can become trainers themselves and help ICANN and other organizations in their capacity-building activities across the world. Next slide, please.

And in addition to those who participated with us on the ground and those training, we have received an enormous amount of content from other partners as well from registries, registrars. This content was something like the sort of business plans or some of them shared some of the case studies, what they have learned, like some new gTLDs shared some of their experiences today to their operations. Some long-time registries and registrars shared experiences as well in the different operational aspects of DNS.

Some shared business plans, some shared some of their financial sort of strategies, some shared their marketing and branding strategies, and that part of the training was actually very useful. And from feedback we received from participants, it was one of the most useful sections of the training. Next slide. So this is one of the groups that attended one of the trainings. Next slide.

Feedback. What we did during each of the trainings, we had feedback and evaluation forms completed on each day on the materials, the content, the instructors, the general atmosphere of the training facility and all this. We also received feedback from the instructors

and some of that feedback is actually posted in one of the blogs online.

Generally, participants found the training very useful, especially the the business track, because that was kind of new for them. And one of the challenges and one of the things that we still need to work on for future trainings is to attract the more business people to these activities.

We were able to attract people from ccTLDs, from local registrars and resellers, kind of ISPs. Mainly technical folks more than the business folks. So we still need to reach out to the non-conventional ICANN community kind of thing to more the locals who do not often show up at ICANN meetings or ICANN kind of forums.

On the technical track, to the train the trainer sessions, key feedback received from people. What is next? Okay, now we participated in this, we're very much willing to participate as trainers in future trainings, and the question was, "Okay, what is next?" And the good news is that we're having a training coming up in a couple of weeks. And as I said, two of the participants will be participating as co-trainers.

We also created a list of alumni over a mailing list for people to continue to engage and share knowledge, and also to provide feedback.

The next phase for this project is the second year, and here ICANN is going to continue to provide more training activities and also to

utilize some of the trained resources from phase one into more training activities during phase two.

And we're also talking to some of our partners to see how we could offer fellowship opportunities for some of the participants to go and attend not only ICANN meetings, but other forums and meetings, as well, and we're also talking to some registries and registrars trying to develop a program for internships, sending people to spend a week to more time with registries and registrars, and to have the sort of firsthand, operational experience. So this is something we are still working on.

On the NTRA side, our key partner, they are going to hire a program manager for – dedicated program manager – for this project, and to develop a business plan. Also, to seek partnerships for the sustainability of this project not only from the ICANN community, but also from the local industry, local and regional industry within Egypt and also the Middle East.

So this is a quick update one of the projects. The other project is the Middle East DNS study. Next slide, please. This, again, was one of the outcomes of the Middle East strategy. Again, people who participated in this effort, the strategy, and also from feedback from the community, they came to realize that there is a problem with the DNS industry in the region, but then there were various views as to what the causes of this problem are. So the recommendation was to conduct a study. Next slide please. And the objective was of the study is to analyze the industry ecosystem in the region and to develop

recommendations on how to advance and to grow the industry and to bring it closer to opportunities available. Next slide.

The scope of the study is to collect data, [micro] data about DNS, about number of domain registrations under CCs, under Gs, and all this about the status of registries, Cs, CC registries, and also new G registries. We have about 15 new gTLD registries from Africa and the Middle East, and also to collect data from registrars and resellers. And, also, to look a little bit outside the narrow area of DNS to grow more into the content, additional content area, into online services from e-government to e-commerce, and also examine the state or the status of these sectors.

Also, part of the scope is to get the end user experience into this with regard to registering domain names, renewing domain names, security of how to keep the domains secure, how to keep the websites secure, the impact of social media on the evolution of the digital industry in general and the domain name in particular, and so forth. Next slide.

So the study will come mainly in three parts. One part is to provide the factual data, the second part is to analyze this data, and third part is to provide recommendations on a way forward. Next slide.

And the timeline. So the RFP was out in March. We received a number of, I think, five or six proposals from five, six different vendors. We finalized the RFP process and we announced the winning bidder for this project, and they are going to start –actually, the starting date of the project was last week, June 18.

They key milestones, August 21 to have the first draft of this study report and to have feedback process with ICANN and finalize this by September 11, and then to have the final report ready by the ICANN Dublin meeting in October.

And the winning bid – next slide, please – is a consortium led by EURid, the European Registry, with some other consultants listed on the slide. Some of them actually are from the Middle East to get more of the local and regional experience from the Middle East.

And with that, I’m done with my slides, and again, thank you very much for the opportunity. And I’ll hand it over to Rodrigo and Carolina. Thank you.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Thank you very much, Baher, for being here, for sharing with us these two very interesting initiatives, which may be very useful in feeding the strategy for our region. And now, we will go back to Latin America, what we are doing in Latin America and the Caribbean in this area. So now I’m going to ask Daniel Fink to give us a general overview of this project, which the community has decided to create to drive the regional strategy.

And after that, we’ll talk about very concrete projects, which do something similar. Carolina will talk about this Anycast Cloud and about a project, or about a study that will analyze the business elements related to ccTLD. So we’ll continue with this logic from the general to the specifics. So Daniel Fink, he’s a member of the Latin

America Caribbean Team, and he's the ICANN Relationship Manager for Brazil, but he's also helping us in projects that are related to this pillar, which we have identified in the strategy for projects that have an economic and business stakeholders approach. So Daniel, thank you very much.

DANIEL FINK:

I'd like to give you some brief overview about the economic projects for our next strategic plan. Next slide, please.

So basically, we've been identifying the economic projects related to the DNS sector, and the main objective for these projects, what they look at is to reduce the participation barriers for our regional economic stakeholders, and later, promote the accreditation of registrars and back-end registries in our region.

And basically, in the next slide, we can see that, in fact, our Steering Committee, if you can change the slide, recommended 12 projects related to these areas. So without going through each one of them, so they are basically divided in these four categories. So first, we should enhance of the communications, the way we talk with our economic stakeholders on new opportunities, on new ways to innovate in the DNS sector, in improving our documents, our contents, and the way they can understand the opportunities.

The second is outreach. Something that we'll talk more like having more awareness, telling them the ideal opportunities, capacity building and so on, and working on accreditation. Perhaps, which

points we should change or recommend for making it easier or more appropriate for some entrepreneurs to become accredited or becoming resellers.

And, also, we have some projects related to inventories, surveys, and research, but we also would like to talk about one gap that perhaps we identified that would be interesting to follow the steps that Baher just mentioned to us.

So in the next slide. So here we have a map. So we gathered some numbers to see how many registrars we have in the different regions. So we see that Asia and Europe and North America basically, like three numbers figures. Whereas in the south, we see like two digits for Latin America and one digit for...

And for me, especially working in Brazil, like, we don't have any 2013 registrar, which makes some difficulties to talk about new gTLDs in the country. So how can we motivate some entrepreneurs to help with this market locally? Like Fadi said, how can we prepare some solutions and combine some services that these companies could operate?

And then in the next slide, some activities that we've been doing, following the recommended projects like approaching to registries and registrars. The ones who already own business.

So a couple of stories, for example. We have a new gTLD registry in Brazil who got his new domain name delegated. Right? And now he's ready to start selling his domain names, but in the first meeting I had

with him, he came like, “Okay, Daniel. I did all my job, I pay all the fees to ICANN and everything. Now [inaudible]. You didn’t prepare a partner for me. Where are my 2013 registrar?” I don’t have the answer.

So we went to the current registrars, 2009 ones, we said, “Why you don’t renew to 2013?” “No, we don’t know. We don’t believe there’s some demand for that.” “Okay. What about this new one who got a list of 10,000 people interested in buying his new domain?” “Oh, that’s interesting. So I’ll become 2013 now.”

Connecting things and giving information to these entrepreneurs, I think is important. So just like the small ISPs in Brazil, the real Internet operators that are very close to their customers in these most cities. I don’t know about other countries in Latin America but in Brazil, we have over 4,000 of them, small companies.

They’ve been, for the last years, very about the [inaudible] telecommunication networks like fibers, radio, and now they are thinking about what else can they do? Can they do some hosting? And then we participated in several meetings of these small ISPs telling them, “Okay, guys. There’s a new market that perhaps you are now aware, but look at what is the New gTLD Programs and how you can combine something.”

And then they start having ideas. “Yeah, sure. I would like to motivate the bakery in front of my office to have a website.” And then, exactly what Fadi said, acting locally could have a lot of value. Right? We’ve

been engaging with in several – even some of them are already filling up the papers, so it’s possible. So that’s a hope.

But in the next slide, if you can change just to conclude. From all the projects for bringing some awareness, promoting, facilitating the documents, even recommending some policies. One thing we still would like very much to do is having some hard facts and recommendations from my study that we could make some diagnostic first for our region and really bring some good recommendations for enhancing our strategies. And that’s why I’ve been talking with Carolina, for example, in LACTLD, and with some other business associations for thinking about some RFP.

They’re developing one study where we could take a look at our region with good researchers and prepare some strong strategies, and to recommend new business models according to our characteristics.

So at this point, I would like to stop here and perhaps we could go for some discussions and what you think that we should address on this diagnostic following the good steps from Baher, from the Middle East and also the good research that have been made in the GDD, as well, about customers’ perception. Right? So I think we could stop from here. Thank you.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Thank you very much, Daniel, for your presentation. I think we have an open mic, so it would be very positive for the strategy in general to

be able to hear your feedback and input regarding what we should do in this regard. Of course, you will have the opportunity to express yourself and provide input regarding the projects during the ICANN meeting.

So now, we will see two concrete projects in the region. Carolina, you have the floor, so could you please tell us about the Anycast Cloud?

CAROLINA AGUERRE:

Thank you very much. I should say that I am not feeling comfortable when speaking about a project which is a technical project. I mean, I am not an engineer, I am not a technical person, and I'm trying to understand the implications of these projects. So I'm not feeling quite comfortable in this regard because, as I said before, I am not a technical person.

Now, I would like to tell you about the origin of this project. This is a regional project at the LACTLD level with the ccTLDs and LACNIC. Many years ago, we began thinking about a project of having a collaborative nature to have synergies and to work together with the ccTLDs in the region in order to strengthen the resiliency and security for ccTLDs and also to create a project with certain characteristics for the members of LACTLD.

So this is the origin of this project. This is a two-year project now. And I should say that we are now able to say that we have these [inaudible] of these LACTLD Anycast Cloud project, and this is NIC Argentina, so this is a great effort.

So briefly, I will tell you the definition of this project. Well, most of you might know the concept of Anycast. So we are defining here the concept of Anycast and Anycast node. So in this project, we are making a difference among different levels. There are many or three different levels of nodes. We have three levels in the platform and in the [signed]. We have architecture on one hand, and then we have management. The management of the three nodes or the three managing nodes that are the BR, the CL, and the House of Internet in Montevideo.

Then we have a definition of user and participatory node, and we will speak about this later on. But, now, taking into account the reasons why we believe this project is important for the region, well, let me tell you that this is important in terms of guaranteeing or ensuring more reliability – I’m sorry; I don’t have the word in Spanish, but to ensure more reliability in terms of DNS services, taking into account geographical dispersion or geographical spreading.

This is also a way of distributing the load of traffic among the different nodes and users of this cloud. This is an additional benefit, and this is to improve the performance of the participatory nodes, and then we have another benefit, which is to promote the security of the participants within a network.

And as we said before and in many technical workshops in LACTLD, and as many other colleagues and providers have said in the past, we can never say that we have enough Anycast when we are thinking about different attacks or DoS attacks. Well, Anycast is not enough.

And now let me tell you something which is important in terms of this project, but this is not on the slides. This is a non-commercial and non-business project, so this is provided only under the best effort regime, so this is based on quality service. And the idea is not to compete with the existing providers, so we have many members in LACTLD providing this service for other parties, but we are not doing that. The idea is not to compete with our providers, so with this, we go back to the first idea of my presentation.

And as I said before, the only purpose of this project is to share experience, infrastructure, and expertise, and to share knowledge and the interest of participating and sharing this infrastructure that we have in the region, which may have a positive impact in the ccTLD management. Next slide, please.

So this is the basis of a project in terms of the management nodes. These are placed at .BR and .CL. This could be expanded, but as I said before, this is a regional project and we are very proud of this and we are very proud of working with many organizations such as LACNIC, LACTLD, and the ccTLDs at the different levels.

These are the resources we have right now. This is the name of the cloud. Next slide, please. And as I said before, the main node is this is the Anycast node. These are the names, the three associated names. We have then the participant's node and the user's node. For user nodes, these are the seven basic technical requirements, so as to start with a service. And then for participants' nodes, we are also considering minimum requirements, hardware requirements. These

are basic requirements, essential requirements, so as not to limit any ccTLD.

The idea is to be inclusive and to work with basic infrastructure, but meeting the five benefits we have already highlighted as main objectives of this project. And therefore, the participant node, these are the hardware configuration requirements. We have a dedicated e-mail for requests for new participants who are joining us in the cloud.

So I would like to say that this is a very new project. We can say that we have started with a project this week, and of course, we will have more interesting news in the future and some stories to tell you when the cloud begins to work and when this is finally launched. But, as I said before for us, it was a great effort to be here in this meeting, the LAC DNS Forum in ICANN, and to be able to tell you that we have already launched this project.

On Monday, you will have all the information on the Web, the LACTLD Web, which is lactld.org/anycast. There, you will have all the information available. You will have the documents available. And, as you know, this took us time because in regional projects, we have different entities with different jurisdictions. So during this week, you will learn more about this.

And I would like to thank the effort of LACTLD and LACNIC because, as I said before, this week, the project was launched and this is a reality.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

As you said before, this is a very new project, but I would like to highlight the efforts by Fred and [Ugo]. We were one of the participants joining lately and the task was quite simple and very dynamic. There was nothing difficult or nothing missing. Everything went smoothly, so I invite you all to share this experience.

I am here with Luciano. Luciano is technical responsible for NIC Argentina. So if you have any question or if you want to know about our experience, please feel free to contact him and join us because when we work as a region, we are all winning. This is a win-win situation. We have a better resolution response time. Regardless it is a huge or small ccTLD, we have the same structure to face any request or any attack to improve, also, the experience of our users. So we are very thankful to LACTLD for the experience.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

So, congratulations. This is a celebration. So that's good for you. Good for you. To sum up this panel, we will speak about other project. We have a preliminary summary report for a study regarding the strengthening of commercial aspects of ccTLDs.

The ccTLDs existing in the region during the last 26 years. Well, these are ccTLD. These are not gTLDs. But within those strategy, we say, "Okay, we need to promote the inclusion of more registrars, but we also need to include gTLDs." So how can we improve this aspect? Then we have certain strategies and certain projects for ccTLDs. So when you have the floor, could you please tell us about this project?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [Inaudible] go to the next slide. Shortly, I'll introduce myself. I've seen so many familiar faces, so I just want to say once hi and wave to everybody instead of doing it every time. People who don't know me, I am [inaudible] and I have between eight and ten years. I have been working out very closely together with ccTLDs mainly in Europe but not only also in the other regions.

This must be I think my sixth time that I've come to [LAC or] LACTLD meeting to give a presentation. It's always very nice. I'm afraid that the last time I made a promise that I would do it in Spanish next time. So next time, I will do it in Spanish, definitely. I'm particularly happy, also, to be here in Buenos Aires, to be back in Buenos Aires this time of the year, because otherwise, I would never, ever have believed that it can be freezing cold over here. Next slide.

I will give a quick overview of the project that I'm working on. I prefer the term "project" than "study" because it's a little bit more dynamic and you will learn why. And I will give a short overview of the different steps we are taking at the moment. Next slide, please.

Like I said, this project focused on the commercial development of the ccTLDs in the region as part of the ICANN LAC strategy project, so ICANN is one of the partners. The other partners in LACTLD, those who are in the room that are not LACTLD members, LACTLD is the organization for ccTLDs in the Latin American and Caribbean region. Next slide, please.

One of the great advantages of having a project led by ICANN and LACTLD is that LACTLD, via LACTLD, we can have access to a great amount of data and information on the ccTLDs in the region. Because if you look to the countries to which the LACTLD members are linked, you see that they cover roughly 93% of the population in the whole Latin American and Caribbean region. So that's a nice way to work with that information. Next slide.

The first part – I mean, the part of the work that has been done 80%, 90% up until now was looking to new region and looking at what is going on, how our ccTLDs, TLDs are developing. And you immediately, definitely if you look from me far away in the nice and warm Brussels at the time of the year.

If you look from some distance, you see a region where the Internet is still growing very fast. You see the domain names are growing. The domain market is growing in the region. If you look to the individual countries, you see that the use of ccTLDs is still growing. Also, if you look back to the growth rate in the last five, six years, you see that the ccTLDs in the Latin American region, they can altogether grow faster than the ccTLDs in general.

Also, grow faster than the gTLDs, and then you basically can conclude this is just a nice environment, a very great business, very nice moment because you can all sit back, relax, and wait until the same thing will happen that has happened ten years ago in Europe that, basically, the domain name markets started to grow together with

the development of the Internet and together with more users getting online. More domain names are registered. Next slide, please.

So why would you bother? Why would you think about the commercial strategy? Why would you think about doing things differently? Next slide.

Because, of course, and you all know most of it, but between knowing and everyday thinking about it twice is different. There are a number of challenges, there are number of factors that are completely different at this moment, at this period, and the environment completely different than, for example, 10-15 years ago when the domain name markets was developing in Europe.

Of course, you all know the example, the [already] alternative to the ccTLDs. New gTLDs and gTLDs. There are alternative ways to use the Internet. What will be the effect of instant messaging, social networks, apps? I mean, if we don't use – we use less e-mail to communicate or e-mail less is dominant. I mean, all that kind of examples. [Inaudible] ask the question, what is the influence on the domain name market, on the ccTLD market?

Also, because it's a different time. If it's a different position, if you look to a market where you have really developed ccTLDs, and all of a sudden, they have to compete or they have the influence of apps, social networks, and so on. What will the effect be on smaller ccTLDs or part of a region where you see, well, basically everything is still developing? Or the ccTLDs are still growing.

And it brings me to the last point. What is the evolution of the market? If you look on Twitter, if you look on the newsletters, you'll see that there are some people that say, "Okay, the growth is slowing down. There is a consolidation." I think the French registry has published a short study less than a month ago, in which they say, "If you look to the global markets, we see that for a number of ccTLD registries, we see consolidation in 2017." Next slide, please.

So all these things together make me realize [inaudible] on one side, you have a very positive environment, very positive region with a lot of opportunities, but on the other side, things have changed and there are a lot of challenges. So this not a strange or would not be a strange decision to say that maintaining a sustainable growth should be one of the main or should be the main strategic goal for all ccTLD registries together. Next slide.

And rather than coming up with saying, "Okay, this or this is the best way to continue that sustained growth, [there are] different ways or different elements and all ccTLDs or most ccTLDs have their own characteristics or their own local situation." And they can, or they should look to their own situation and see what is best and which breaks which ways are for us the best to come up with the strategy. What can we do? I put a number of elements on the slide. For example, do we have to work on our sales channel? Do we have to think how we say how we sell domain names? Do we have to take specific marketing initiatives for our own markets?

I mean, first of all, what is our market? Which market do we want to reach? Do we have to think about our pricing? Do we have to look at our registration process and the requirements that still exist in some ccTLDs?

Another, and I think it came already in some – for example, also, in some of the projects Baher was talking about. The importance of having the domain name being used because if people are using a domain name, it's less likely that it will throw it away or that [inaudible] because the costs will be much higher than if it's just the domain name you registered for any other reason, like you say, "Okay, it's kind of similar to my e-mail address or whatever." So these are a number of strategies that can all help in building or moving to securing that sustainable growth. Next slide, please.

And then the next steps, because like I said, rather than looking at this as a study or a report, I prefer to look at it as a project. Because one of the most important things will happen tomorrow. This together with or LACTLD is organization a marketing workshop, and that marketing workshop will be used, basically, to look at some of those findings and to discuss with the ccTLDs, how they see the evolution, how they see what is if some registries in the other side of the world are saying, "Oh wait, we really have to start changing our strategy because, otherwise, we will run into a kind of consolidation. Or even worse, we're afraid that registrations will go down for this region. Is this something we need to adapt to?"

So tomorrow, there will be a first large section in which most –well, many of the people that are here today – will be present. I really say you will be asked to work in small groups, so already be afraid and go to sleep early tonight. There will be, really, in groups, ccTLDs together discussing what is going on, how will we take challenges? How we will take the opportunities?

The second part of the session or the meeting tomorrow is, I think, as important. I mentioned it on the previous slide, that one of the ideas of the commercial strategy could be to develop your sales channel. LACTLD has taken the initiative to open up the afternoon session of their meeting and invite a number of registrars already active in the region or also registrars planning or that are active in the regions but not yet have the region as their main focus. And to discuss with them two things that are, I think, the afternoon is two panels, but two important questions.

The first one goes back on the reality, how come there are so few registries and registries that have a registry/registrar model? Is that because the registries need to change a little bit and be more attractive to attract the interest of registrars? The second panel will be once you have visibly as important [inaudible] is the next step. Once you have that registry/registrar model, how do you work very well together with them? How do you, for example, make sure if you want to change your policy, how can you involve your registrars? How can you work together not [inaudible] see them as we are the registry, they are the registrars, but define that common goal, saying,

“Okay, we want to push those ccTLDs or registrations. How can you do that together?” For example, by doing some marketing initiatives.

So that are the two next steps that are this week on the agenda and then, of course, after the project, then the report of the study will come. Thank you.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Thank you very much. I was very pleased to learn that we will have this practical interaction with the registries so as to get their feedback so the project or the study will meet its goal, that it's practical, that it can be applicable, and that it can be useful. So now it's about time to close this session. We have about seven minutes left, and maybe we can use them for some questions.

And after that, we'll have another open mic session chaired by [inaudible] and maybe we will also have some questions in that session, so you have some questions you may hold in for this afternoon session. Albert, could you please raise your hand? Albert is in charge of engagement for ICANN for Latin America and the Caribbean, but he's now in charge of the remote participation. How many people do we have online right now, Albert?

ALBERT DANIELS:

11.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA: Because there are people who are not able to attend, so we have remote participation with simultaneous run session. Thank you very much, Albert. So remote participants, you may ask questions, too. Is there any question? Eduardo?

EDUARDO SANTOYO: This is a question for Cyrus about the program for new gTLDs, and there are several questions. First of all, I'd like to congratulate you because, yes, there has been a great execution by ICANN structure in providing a solution for this first round of domains and applications. We can see that there are already several which are in line and operating, and many others that will be operating soon.

So my question is which are the general criteria we're going to use within ICANN so as to assess the general success of this round? So based on our first goal as a committee where we decided to open the possibility of applying to new gTLDs, which is going to be the set of metrics or criteria to assess the performance or compliance with those goals? And how long will we take to decide or assess that the results of these operations have met the criteria?

And regarding this, we have a second question. Will there be a new or will there be new rounds of applications for top-level domains? How many rounds? Is ICANN thinking of opening this space so that anybody may submit an application that will be taken into account immediately? As if we were talking about the Sunrise process in the launching of the general registration of domains, of top-level domains, or maybe we just want to reach some goals – very concrete

political goals – which at some time will be met with only a few rounds? That was my question.

CYRUS NAMAZI:

Gracias, Eduardo. That was a lot of questions, actually, but good questions. In terms of the metrics and criteria for success of a New gTLD Program, I think that really is a good key question. I think in our ecosystem in the past, we've typically measured success by the number of second-level domain names and websites that were attached to a particular top-level domain name.

By that metric, the New gTLD Program is still quite small. To date, with 650-plus new gTLDs in delegation, we are just north of 6 million domain names in operation in the New gTLD Program. And when you compare that against the 150 million or so that are available predominantly in com, net, and some ccTLDs. So that's a very small portion.

The whole idea of measuring the success of the program is something that's been debated, actually, for a long time in the community, and at least from ICANN's perspective, it's not for ICANN to decide that. That's for sure. So what's going on at ICANN is something that I mentioned earlier, which is this study, a number of reviews that we've undertaken to, over time, measure the impact of the New gTLD Program, measure the impact on competition, measure the impact on consumer trust, consumer choice, and see how from the start, which is really now. We just concluded the first round of a consumer

survey I mentioned earlier, which is published – in a year from now, how has the needle moved?

And it's really, then, for the community to decide has this been a valuable undertaking for us? So I don't see ICANN as being in a position to actually decide these things. We work with the community to implement what ultimately our process decides for ICANN to do.

To answer your second question, will there be a subsequent round? I think the community has already spoken. Our Board actually has a resolution that there will be a subsequent round. The question is what is the timing of it? The timing of it, I think –again, this is just me predicting. Nobody knows for sure because there's too many variables involved. But I think the timing of it is not going to be before 2017, just given everything that we have to do to get to a point that we can collectively decide that yes, there can be, and should be, a subsequent round.

And then the other part of your question was the format of it. Will we do an open round kind of like what we did in the first round, and we close it, then go process it, and then reopen a third round? My own personal view is that the subsequent round should just be an open round because we've learned so much from the first round that the necessity of having a closed application process that we say, "Okay, we take applications for three months, then we close it."

I don't see that being necessary anymore. It may change, obviously, but I think we can get to a point of maturity in terms of having top-level domains, new top-level domains being delegated into the root

so that it can just be an open process for us. So I hope that answers your question. Thank you very much.

RODRIGO DE LA PARRA:

Thank you very much. Well, time is up. We'll now have time for a coffee break. Coffee is already waiting for us. There is also some juice and some snacks, croissants. So I'd like to thank the members of the panel, Carolina, Daniel, Cyrus, [inaudible], and Baher. Thank you very much for sharing this panel with us, and thank you very much for attending.

[break]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

There was an e-mail address, which is [abuse]@lacnic.net. It was not published as a content point for the region because this is just an internal e-mail address, but we were receiving many e-mails by people reporting those cases. So we knew that this was happening, and the last straw was two years ago when we received a huge list that was sent to us of open recursive DNS. It was about 3,000 or 4,000. So we were frustrated at that time because we didn't have the capability and we didn't have the resources and the manpower to work on that. Because having such a list is not a list that may be published in an e-mail address, so we had to perform a WHOIS analysis, we have to send notifications to the parties, so we were receiving reports by the community and they were very similar to security incident responses.

So the idea was to get evidence and to act upon that to apply policies and do it in a consistent way. So with the approval of the LACNIC CEO and Director, we started to work on an incident response system. So LACNIC has no technical or operational responsibility on those incidents. Therefore, we cannot go to change the configuration of a router or we cannot go and see a machine. And then, it was also interesting to [define] without the certs involvement, one of the parameters defining a cert is the objective of that cert.

And that is defined taking into account the company, for example. This is the cert that belongs to such a company or this is a cert that belongs to a certain country. In our case, we are not a cert, we are not an ISP, so what are we? So we had to make an analysis, and this was important for us because we are a community which is defined in two ways or that can be defined in two ways.

On one hand, we are an institution, a community of institutions having IP resources or a community from LACNIC. We have the legacy resources, on one hand, and in our region, we don't have such an amount of legacy resources, but we have some of them. They're associated to universities, mainly.

Then, we created something that we call a cert that was defined as those organizations in the region having IP resources assigned or allotted by LACNIC. The next step to define this tool was the way and the road of this tool. As we said before, we do not have an operational responsibility, so we have a coordination responsibility in terms of incident.

But there was an additional detail, which was our relationship with the organizations. This relationship is not as strong as a corporation or as a national authority. So we got the input from the people from Brazil, and we got a definition, which is the WARP, and these are the Warning Advice and Reporting Points.

This is used as a mediation stage or as a brokering stage. So what we do is we gather information about the incident and we provide the information. So we make all the efforts related to conducting contacts, contacting people, for example. I mean, any contact that we have taken into account the seriousness of the incident, and we provide the possibility of contacting the members.

WARP is not our invention, although I would like to say that it was so, but this was an idea that we borrowed from the British Government, and this is a very interesting figure because they had many systems that were similar to the cert system, but they didn't have the volume and they didn't have the resources to do that. So they created the WARP. These are Warning Advice and Reporting Point. Next slide, please, [Gonzalo].

I have already mentioned this, so when it comes to the services to be delivered, we will provide services to the LACNIC community in general, but we are open, as well, to other communities. We will provide this information to open mailing lists. And the main service will have to do with the incident mediation, and this is something that we began doing on November 1 last year.

Incidents. Where do they come from? Where do we get that information? We got that information from many resources. We do it in a passive way. That is to say we gather information from the e-mails that we receive or messages through mailing lists, or individual reports sent by people, and from a web template created for that and the idea is to have a more proactive tool, for example, by using honeypot or other tools, but we are now consolidating the operational capacity of this WARP system.

As I said before, since November last year, we began opening these Pandora boxes and we began working on this, and we found that there was 20,000 e-mails within this e-mail, and we're not paying attention to that. Of course, there were not all of these e-mails were reporting incidents. Much of this e-mail was spam. But we were able to extract approximately 70 incidents or 70 issues or reports that were considered to be incidents.

We have also set up several collaboration agreements with various organizations for them to share information with us, so to be able to identify incidents that may be of interest to the community. And we have expanded some activities we were already carrying out at LACNIC, such as regular meeting in region, which we have as part of the May and October meeting of LACNIC, so as to improve collaboration.

So here, I have some data I'd like to share with you. Things we have found, you are all very familiar with this. Some of you unluckily familiar with DDoS attacks using amplification. Some of you have

been involved, all of you as victims, I hope none of you as attackers. But there is an industry of using amplification attacks using SNMP. I didn't know that was happening, and we had tons of reports defined in the origin ports and in the communities, the SNMP communities that were being used.

So we set up a collaboration [inaudible] victims of those attacks and company will provide hosting for gambling or gaming service in a region. There is something similar with NTP vectors and NTP servers [are] many phishing reports. Phishing for us, for LACNIC's WARP is this sort of this gray area because it doesn't involve the malicious use of an IP address, it's something more complex. So anyway, we tried to provide some mediation here, too.

We also received reports on router hijacking. [Gonzalo], please don't get distracting. You're in charge of the slides. Some things I have already mentioned. The [SIRT's] meeting we participate in October, May. Or LACNIC for some time has had an activity, actually activities workshops on responses to security incidents, and we put everything under the same umbrella so as to create consistency and to learn from one another. And I think this is the last slide.

Thank you very much. Thank you for your patience, because I've taken the floor for quite [inaudible] if you thought we were finishing earlier, you are wrong, because we have some questions.

I think that it's good to talk about the issues that have been mentioned during this session. This is an open session. I have some

questions myself, but there is a mic in the room. So if you are interested in making question, well, this is an open session.

I'd like to start by the end, which is asking Don, in English, about universal acceptance.

What would you say this means for Latin America? Because the more skeptical of us will say, "Okay, you know, Spanish is almost ASCII so maybe we can basically ignore the problem." But I think it's relevant of this is why I'm asking. I mean, I would say, another key question.

And also, I would like to know whether there's Latin American participation in the working group.

DON HOLLANDER:

Thank you. The second question, the Latin American participation in the working group is quite small. Big in stature, small in number. So we would like to have more of both. And why is this an issue in Latin America? So this is where I get a little bit passionate and I apologize.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

I like that.

DON HOLLANDER:

My problem is I am fundamentally monolingual, but I recognize very much the issue that I want my Internet – I want your Internet, for you, to be in your language completely. In the Middle East, I want somebody to not have to know English. In rural Thailand – and the

Thai script is beautiful. I have no idea how it works, but it is a beautiful script. But if I'm in rural Thailand, I don't want them to have to know anything about the English character set.

And the same throughout Latin America. Margarita was very kind to provide education for me a couple of years ago about the different languages, the different characteristics. And I think she used the word papa, and I'll probably pronounce each, but you can spell papa different ways.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: [Inaudible] father. And the English translate [inaudible] from Spanish to English.

DON HOLLANDER: And it means different stuff. So why shouldn't you be able to use the right word in your domain name? And that's why I think it's an issue for Latin America as much as it is an issue for Thailand or for Egypt or for anywhere else in the world. And even in the United States, which is the melting pot of the world, people in the US should be able to use the Internet in the language of their choice. So that's why I think it's important.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: I find this topic extremely interesting. Margarita, is there a mic over there?

MARGARITA VALDES CORTES: When [.CL] implemented IDN some years ago, we were happy because we had introduced the seven characters that are between ASCII in English and the English set of characters, and set of characters in Spanish. But eventually, what usually happens – and this happens everywhere – only 2%, at least in the ccTLD industry, only 2% of the addresses that are registered are [IDL].

When we talk about the specific set of characters in a country like Russia, probably, IDN is stronger because you have this effect. Russian people don't want and don't have to know English to use the Internet, and I think this is right, the way it should be.

However, the barrier to the [inaudible] idea initially to the software industry because if, in the long end, Valdes with the stress on the e, which is the way we write my name in Spanish. If I cannot use Valdes with a stress on the e, the way you write it in Spanish, if I cannot use a stress, the value of the domain decreases. So the industry doesn't help us here because developers will use domain names were actually don't helping users to have a webpage with their name properly written with an e-mail address properly written, but also with an e-mail so they can use their names.

So how are we going to persuade the industry? How do we reach out to them so they will help us to improve on this scenario? How could we attract them to thinking in these terms?

DON HOLLANDER:

Thank you for the question. I take that off so I don't have to hear. And it is an area that I hope the ccTLDs in the community will help reach out to your local community to say, "Here's this opportunity. It's a global opportunity, but it's a local issue, as well."

We're trying to find some models for engagement, and there is no ideal model yet, and there's very few examples, but there are some. So the ties have recently, in May, convened a local meeting with government, with ISPs, with the registry, with registrars, with academia. I forget who else was there. And they said, "This is an issue. How do we address it small first, making sure the registry and registrars can support it, then a little bit broader to make sure the infrastructure providers can support it, a little bit broader to make sure that governments can support it, and then a broader communication channel, as well?"

The fixing of the issue is – it's not really too hard, I don't think, as a CIO. So IT, I don't know what the word is in Spanish, but the senior IT person in an organization. It's not really hard, but it takes effort because you have to look at every one of your systems. So you have to make a decision, when are you going to do that and how to prioritize that?

But first, there are a couple of core infrastructure bits that are missing. So Microsoft Exchange, which is used by – how many people here use Microsoft Exchange? A few? Four. I'll bet many of your registrants will use Microsoft Exchange. So Microsoft Exchange

doesn't yet support it. So if I'm a CIO and I'm running Microsoft Exchange, why should I change my systems before it's ready?

The good news is Microsoft is working on this, has been working on it, and in Thailand, demonstrated a beta version of their Outlook client. So that suggests at the APTLD meeting last year in Oman, we had somebody from Microsoft and somebody from Google talk about the issues.

And the fellow from Microsoft made a very interesting point. He said it affects over 100,000 different places in their programming and operating system place. It's everywhere. So that's why it has not been a quick fix for them. They've been working on it for years. The fact that they showed a demo of the Outlook client beta I think is a very positive sign.

So to answer your question, we would like to work particularly with the CCs, but also the whole members within the DNS community to reach out to your community to show them the opportunities. We don't have a model for you to follow yet, but we would be delighted to work with you as you evolve that.

And I'll just give you one other story. So you talked about the Valdes, right? So I live in New Zealand. We have three official languages in New Zealand, two written – one is English, the other is Maori – and I'll give you a quick lesson in Maori.

So the word for book in Spanish is libro. In Maori, it's pukapuka. To make it books, more than one book, in Spanish, you add an S, libros.

In Maori, you add NGA to the beginning. So it's nga pukapuka, but the A has a bar over it to say that it's a long a, so it's nga pukapuka. So I have the domain name, ngapukapuka.nz, because I have a bookshop, and I have my e-mail address is toa, which means shop, @ngapukapuka.nz. So I have been using that e-mail address to register on Websites in New Zealand and to engage with the government and the tax department. [Oi!].

They can't cope with it. Even the Maori Party, so there's the New Zealand political party, their systems aren't well able to cope with it. Internet NZ is still working on getting their systems to be able to handle them, but they're not making progress. So it is a personal issue for me. I think it's the right thing to do for the people of the world, and it's the right thing for you to do for your community.

CARLOS MARTINEZ: I have some questions for [inaudible]. Comments that he believes that some special focus should be put on people who develop DNS libraries.

DON HOLLANDER: DNS libraries?

CARLOS MARTINEZ: Yeah, [inaudible] libraries because many products will not implement DNS querying by themselves but basically reuse DNS library from other providers.

DON HOLLANDER: [Inaudible] library.

CARLOS MARTINEZ: All right. Yeah. Programming libraries in general.

DON HOLLANDER: Programming languages we've got. DNS libraries I think was not on the radar, so thank you.

CARLOS MARTINEZ: And this more a joke than a question. Patricio from Chile comments that there were – NIC CL was once sued in court by someone who claimed his or her IDN domain didn't work, and the reason was that it was broken or he claimed that it was broken because his e-mail didn't work. So it's interesting. Exactly.

CARLOS MARTINEZ: As it's 1:00 sharp, I thank you for your patience and I hope you have enjoyed this session. If you have further questions or remarks, we'll all be available throughout the days. Thank you very much to everybody.

CAROLINA AGUERRE: Thank you very much, Carlos, for moderating this session. We will have an open-mic session after panel number three. This is not only

to answer questions from previous panels, but also questions from panel number three, as well. We are now circulating some sheet of papers to take notes of the participants in the DNS forums and to be able to compare that with our records.

So if you could be so kind so as to complete with that information. And now, we would kindly invite you to go to the back of the room where you have lunch. This is an hour lunch and this is finger food. So we resume the session at 2:00 PM. Thank you very much.

[break]

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

....would deliver or will deliver his presentation. It is very important to understand how we can improve the DNS world. Our panelists, each of them will provide the point of view, but they will speak about a different perspective and a different way of defining and improving, something which is fundamental in our structures, and this is the DNS service. Therefore, and in this sense, I would like to highlight. And I don't know if you have any order of speakers, if you want to introduce yourselves.

Perhaps we can start. Okay, so Oscar doesn't want to be the first one. So Ariel or Tony or both of you will be the first speakers. So now I will give the floor to a great and a very prestigious speaker, Argentinian speaker, Tony Harris.

TONY HARRIS:

Thank you very much, Gabriel, for your kind presentation. So once again, I will apologize and will present the Ariel Graizer from CABASE. He's my boss. And I will speak about the business opportunities for the participants in Latin America and the opportunities that we can have within the domain name industry. Next slide, please..

So within ICANN, when we speak about the resources that ICANN has to create domain name business, generic domain names business, we have two streams. We have the registry stream. I use my own language to define these concepts for me. A registry would be the licensor, and the registry [implies] to present an application to file an application to use [inaudible] of the original [DOV].

So this requires the opening of an application round. As you may know, three years ago, there was the opening of an application round with more than 109,000 applications. And we learned today that there are more than 650 new domain names functioning in the root.

When it comes to the other streams, the registrar stream would be [delivered] somehow. The sailing chain for generic domain names. So these are implies to be created by ICANN as a registrar, and I will explain this further. And also, this can be done at any time. This to say we don't have to wait for a call from ICANN to be accredited as a registrar. Today, this afternoon, after this meeting we can do it, of course, if we comply with all the requirements.

To be an accredited registrar means, as you can see here, there are certain requirements, which are important to take into account. In this case, I would like to say that I am not criticizing the structure of

this system, and this is not ICANN's fault, either. But obviously, let's see and let's think about a business or a company in Latin America that says that that company wants to be an ICANN registrar and sell domain names.

So I have to pay, as a company, an initial fee of \$3,500 and an annual fee of \$4,000, a minimum contribution per registered domain name, and if I'm not wrong, this is 25 cents per domain name. And then we have a quarterly contribution that is being paid by all the registrars as a whole. This is not specified in the application when we proceed with a filing of the application, so this creates a bit of uncertainty.

And if I accept and I access to be an ICANN-accredited registrar, I will be sharing the space with GoDaddy. This is just for you to have an idea of the dimension. So I will be competing with companies such as Network Solutions, [inaudible] GoDaddy.

Then we have other issue, which is quite complicated for our part of the world, and this is to have a general commercial responsibility insurance of \$500,000. We tried to become a registrar in CABASE a year ago, and we were encountering many barriers and problems, and then we found out at the local level, and on the local market, the cost of such an insurance. And if I'm not wrong, and I don't want to exaggerate, but the cost of that insurance was \$10,000 or \$12,000 on a yearly basis. And then there is another requirement, which is to have a certificate to access a bank credit, which is to be certified by a bank of \$70,000, and this is not local currency. That is dollars.

Now, let's take the other stream, which is a registry. I mean, this has not been – I cannot say today I will become a registry because now the system, the procedure is closed until there is another or a new call, I have no opportunity to become a registry. However, the application fee, the amount of money that is going to be touched to file an application is \$185,000. And if I get approved, the application, in my case, I had a successful application, and then I found out that I still needed \$140,000 that had to be deposited in a bank on behalf of ICANN by means of a letter of credit.

So as you can see, you can imagine, and we can say, “Okay, I am happy with this, I am quite interested in the domain name industry. So what should I do? Should I become a registry? Should I become a registrar?” Well, but when we proceed as we move forward, we are encountering, let's say, not barriers or obstacles, but certain considerations that we need to take into account.

So why does this happen and why is it so difficult and so complicated for someone who is in this part of the world to become a registrar? Well, we should take into account that in the year 2000, if I'm not wrong, all dot-com domain names were sold by one company, which was Network Solutions, if I'm not wrong.

When ICANN began to develop its policies in the year 2000, it decided it should be in competition in the domain name industry. That is to say, it was not possible for only one company to have the power to exploit a resource, such as dot-com, without any competition, because there was no price competition either in dotcom domain

name, for those who were active at that time would know that dot-com domain name was registered by paying an amount of \$30 on a yearly basis.

So when ICANN decided to do that, there was a new group of registrars, and that group of companies that quickly accessed that were insiders, they knew the market, they knew what was going on. They belonged to Europe and the US and perhaps someone from Australia, but what do they have in favor? They had a base or a database of dot-com and dot-net registrars with 70 million of domain names to share and to begin working and operating their business.

So if I became a registrar in 2000, I would have access to a kind of possibility to capture such an amount of available domain names because they belonged to Network Solutions, and they were going to be operated by other registrars. There was a price war and, of course, those who offered the registrants the lower prices had the better share until we see that reflected in the market, because they are the ones who had the bigger share.

Those people, when we presented this topic in ICANN, they told us that we are looking for an advantage over them, that we are looking for privileges that they do not have. So what are they talking about? I mean, where is the share that they had in the past and where is the benefit that they had in the past? So I believe that these considerations are really important to take into account in order to understand and have a better understanding of this market and of

the business, and, of course, the difficulties that we might encounter when we want to participate.

And it's somehow a pity because the message that is somehow received in our region is that this place is already occupied, and if we want to participate, okay, we should go to the bank and get ready for that. And I believe that perhaps this is not the most useful way and we know that ICANN manages global resources and that we all have the same rights but we came late to the party, [to put it] somehow.

And when it comes to new rounds or opportunities to request or apply for a gTLD, well, we are not talking about a new round. And perhaps we might investigate if it was really necessary to charge everybody \$185,000, and perhaps in our next round, we may have more reasonable conditions. In Argentina, I spoke with two or three provinces in our country to help them to file an application, for example, for do-Cordoba or dot-Santafe, but when they realized the amount of money that they had to pay, they said no.

They were really surprised, and now we have certain cities such as Berlin, London, or provinces like Quebec in Canada that have already paid for that. So, I think, and I will stop here because I am taking too much time for this, but I think these are ideas that I would like to inform that I would like to put on the table, not as a critics, but as a way of looking at the reality. Thank you.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

Thank you very much, Tony. We will leave questions by the end of this session. Now I would like to share the opinion of Eduardo Santoyo. He's the current Director of dot-co from Colombia. He's also the LACTLD Director. He's a friend of mine and a colleague who has great knowledge of the market, of the distribution chains, and registrars. So perhaps you can give us your insights.

EDUARDO SANTOYO:

I don't know if I can give you or provide bright ideas, but of course, I will share my views on this. And perhaps, I will start my presentation by taking something that Tony said before, and this has to do with the change that there should be in terms of players with the implementation of the new gTLD programs that has been implemented for some time now by ICANN.

And I've mentioned this because, as I said before this morning, when we were talking about the presentation of the New gTLD Program, I remembered that the reasons for a new round of gTLDs was to increase the participation or engagement of players in the DNS development and in other parts of the world, and particularly to try to have those countries in the southern hemisphere, those countries to have more participation with new gTLDs and new agents and new players.

Of course, this reason should be taken into account in order to provide a more reasonable and concrete evolution of the program. This is not fully compliant with because at the beginning of the process, the applications that were filed by other regions were very

low in comparison to the volume of the total amount of applications that were filed. So this means that we will have very few players in the region, but the registry and the registrar, the registrar and the registry will not be enough so as to generate a changing environment for the general engagement [map] in the Internet industry. And this, of course, is of great concern to us after the end of this program and after the end of this round.

In order to promote the creation of initiatives to promote the creation of efforts and activities in this region to have more registrars, more registries, and more players in the industry coming from Latin America, and this is a call for us to be aware, to contribute to the general assessment process for this new round of gTLDs, and that we contribute to the discussion of principles that should involve the second round so that those elements may be helpful and may contribute to the geographical democratization of the process and the creation, of course, of industries related to the DNS.

And this is somehow to supplement what Tony was saying before. We have certain barriers that we are facing. We know it is not easy, but it is now our turn to pay attention to this general assessment of the program and, of course, for the new gTLD program in order to comply with our goals.

On the other hand, I wanted to let you know that in the last few months, there have been some changes in the DNS area in the region. I'd like to mention this one again not to be [inaudible] but just because I think it's important for [inaudible] Carolina mentioned this

earlier this morning, the idea of the Anycast Cloud that will be launched by LACTLD for the country codes community in the region.

Why? Because it's a contribution by the community that will help improve security and stability of the system and it's the result of the comparative efforts of the local community, which together with another regional organization, such as LACNIC, has been able to create a management framework that will support the operations of the ccTLDs that really contribute significantly to the improvement of the stability of the Internet in Latin America.

And this is very important, and I'm highlighting it because although it's true that we have an infrastructure in the management of the dot-co thanks to our head company, the one that provides the DNS services in a network called UltraDNS, which was or is [selling, then] in the commercially. So we can now see that on one hand, acknowledging the importance of a service like this one, we are glad to see that the region has been able to adopt the same framework of comparative effort to develop the Anycast network.

And I'd like to also stress the work LACTLD has been carrying out, but increasingly more working jointly with other organizations such as ICANN, ISOC, and LACNIC in this process of building or creating together, joining efforts to develop the strategy for community engagement, relating this to what ICANN is doing with [inaudible], and we have seen important breakthroughs, especially in the setting up of actions that help to improve the operational conditions for [S] country codes.

We have learned, or this morning, we heard [Wayne] talk about the joint efforts ICANN and the country codes community are carrying out to create areas for improvement in the business arena, but we have also worked jointly and in cooperation to [analyze] cybersecurity and technical operations.

There is a lot to share and there is a long way to go, and from that point of view, although I am not mentioning any new actors. What I am saying is that there are new areas of work, coordinated and joint work, among different stakeholders in the community. And before finishing, I'd like to mention a new stakeholder that is becoming increasingly important in our regions that is the Organization of American States, the OAS. An organization made up of countries in the region that has explained its interest in understanding and finding areas for discussion regarding the management and the DNS in the region, with a twofold purpose.

Number one, cybersecurity, cyber-defense as a concern for them because considering the increasing importance of Internet in a development of government activities, trade in general in the everyday life of all of us as citizens. The OAS considers [it] necessary to be present and to foster discussions about the way all of this is management.

All this issue, and from that point of view, between the first [firm] and this one, well, we can see that those areas for discussion have been expanding and they will be fostered and driven, and we will have

those discussions more frequently. They will be working with us and they are welcome to do so, of course.

So government organizations and the states and intergovernmental organizations are becoming increasingly present players in all these discussions, and it's important to stress this because they are there, and we're going to foster such discussions. I don't know how much time I have left but I would also like to leave some time for questions later on. Thank you.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

Thank you, Eduardo. Now I'd like to introduce Mr. Bojorquez, the Marketing Director of dot-mx, who will talk about the case of complements, everything that has been said up to now. He's the Marketing Director and he has expertise in the implementation of dot-lat. So if you'd like to share with us your experience.

ERNESTO BOJORQUEZ:

Good afternoon, everybody. Thank you for inviting me to this session. Thank you, Carolina and Eduardo and Gabriel. I'd like to talk about the dot-lat. Dot-lat has submitted about 2,000 applications for new TLDs. It is an initiative, which was born in our region, coming from eCOM-LA. We have been working for over eight years in this project. Besides what Tony was saying when he talked about the costs, the fees, the hard facts related to developing a new TLD. Well, time is also money and many efforts were put into meeting those requirements,

and so this is a time eight years, it's the time the whole process took us, so we have been working for eight years to develop it.

Everything was born when COMLAC talked to NIC Mexico and they invited us to do some technology transaction. Tony asked us to contribute so that we can help them develop dot-lat with our technology platform, and we suggested that we could also contribute something from the business point of view. NIC Mexico, starting in 2004, has been working in marketing and in promoting the ccTLD. Mexico is in a special situation with the generic domains, dot-com especially.

In Mexico, it's very common for somebody to have a generic domain or an mx domain. At some point in time, mx were less than 50% of the total number of domains in Mexico and we had to develop marketing strategies so as to change this, and we learned quite a bit here, so shared this with eCOM-LAC, and took [inaudible] work together to create the dot-lat, and that's how dot-lat was born.

Today, we're still in the launching stage, so we worked hard for eight years finding different issues that had to be overcome. Some of them were quite simple to overcome. It was just up to us. But in some other cases, it was up to elements of factors related to our economies or our countries' issues such as insurances. It wasn't easy to get an insurance company that would offer this perk. There wasn't a wide choice, and it took some time until we found the right vendor for insurances, for example.

Eventually, dot-lat is a domain that was born to identify people and organizations, cases, and projects of Latin origin in Internet. It offers a space in Internet with Latin identity, and this is what dot-lat is offering, which is the road or the path to sell this. This morning, we heard about some strategies that could be used to market the name, so dot-lat is based on this, on the promotion of Internet, on getting people to know what they can use Internet for.

For many of us, it may be something very simple to understand, but in the world we find users that don't see how useful Internet may be for them, and I want to communicate this in the first place. We don't go out to sell a domain name. We actually try to get people to understand the power of the Internet for their cases and their situation.

So when they start using Internet to improve their business, they will need a domain name, and that's where we are able to offer them our products and suggest some product. So promoting the Internet, communicating it, creating awareness of that we have education, helping users to find advice, training, so that they can learn how to use Internet so that what they have decided to do, they may eventually do.

And the last component is the marketing or selling of domains, and here is where we have what dot-lat and other similar initiatives in the region provide. That is, creating a platform that will really enable domains to be accessible for the people, that it's easy to get a domain name or a service to create a webpage to get the web hosting

service and e-mail service, and this is the infrastructure that is required in our case in Latin America. So this is what dot-lat needs to do, promote Internet, educate about the Internet, and have a good and strong path [from to] market and sell domain names.

Basically, what we are creating with dot-lat is this bit of community about people of Latin origin. This initiative takes into account all people from Latin America and also people from Latin America spread throughout the world, especially those who are in the US.

This is just one picture, but it shows what we do so as to get Latins to become identified with this and to see themselves as a community. We have been working with eCOM-LAC and all its partners in other countries in Latin America, and also with some associations and organizations present in the US and that work with people of Latin origin in the US.

What is the value that an initiative like dot-lat may provide for the region? More exposure of the domain category. In marketing terms, when we talk about water, beverages, or beer, or any kind of product, we call it category. In the case of domains, well, we have the same.

To what extent do people know what domains are like? How many people know what a domain name is and how they could use it? And eventually, this gets people to know what a domain category is about. This is what we want to do in the region. By operating dot-mx, we learned that it was very important for people to learn about it and to know what they could use it for. And this is what we want to do through dot-lat.

Through dot-lat, we don't want to get to the countries and compete directly with the ccTLD of the country. We just want to provide complementary services and to promote and educate about the Internet, trying to get the category to grow and thus expand the market. This is our goal, and we are doing this with Mexico, and we have the ccTLD dot-mx, but we are trying to get dot-lat to penetrate into the Mexican market.

This is what we are doing and we also want dot-lat to support the development of capabilities and capacities in the region. Capacity building related to Internet and the marketing of domain names and the marketing of ISP services.

We want the marketing channels to be developed with local vendors. We want new companies to be created to promote these marketing services. As Tony said, it's very difficult for a new company or for a small company in our countries to start competing with the big international players.

The players that hold tens of millions of domains, so the economies of scale will work for them, and the small ones cannot compete. However, there are other strategies. For example, strategies of being closer to the customer, providing a more customized service, and this opens a new area where the small players may compete through initiatives like dot-lat. We want to help these players.

Of course, we have to work with registrars that are accredited with ICANN, but we also want to develop the distribution chain from then downwards so that some countries may participate and later be

accredited as a root, maybe. And for these services, we need more services, of course, and vendors that are reliable, and this will also eventually this creation of new domains will have huge benefits for the region as a whole.

The current status of the initiative, we are going through the launch stage. In the final part of the launch, we are going through the land rush stage, and this will be completed by July 31, 2015. And at this stage, we use the dynamics used by NIC Mexico in 2019 to work with dot-mx, and it's based on a price scheme whereby prices go down in time. So we start with a high price and the price drops until it gets to a “[inaudible] normal” price.

This is what is happening with dot-lat, rather than speculating with the price of the names, we want to make it expensive to speculate. So instead of having somebody register 1,000 names to be selling them to somebody else in the end, we want to discourage this behavior. We just want people to pay for a name if they see a value in it, or according to the value they see in it, and that's the approach we're using today. If you need more information, you may find it at this webpage. Thank you very much.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

Thank you, Ernesto. And as we are talking about different approaches to the DNS world, so that you may have a different, a wider view, I'd like to introduce Jordi Iparraguirre. I've been rehearsing this throughout the morning. Jordi Iparraguirre is a director and founding founder of PrimusInterPares, and he has experience in the analysis of

zone files – something, which for all of us who have managed DNS think is interesting and fun.

Jordi, yes, it's fun. It's lots of fun. We have never been normal people. Let's live up to it. So Jordi, please share with us your experience.

JORDI IPARRAGUIRRE:

Thank you very much, Gabriel. Everybody has to find their market niche. Nobody's in here, let's go into this area, so thank you very much to the Carolina and to the organizers. I will be very brief. Basically, because I have reorganized my presentation or changed it a little bit. There have been two or three presentations this morning, which I thought were brilliant and very interesting, and I would like to stress what they said because I think that everything together is very valuable.

The question is how could we take advantage of this power in the world of the DNS? And with [inaudible] we saw there is possibilities to grow. There are areas of growth. So I mentioned only three ideas about similar areas where we might grow. How to move from the what to the how, how to do it. the first area would be to stress the strategies for sustainable growth of the TLDs. That is, everything that is around it, the pricing strategy, the prices of the TLD, so they will be high at the very beginning, and after that, they will come down, etc.

And also, registration policies. Some countries, not necessarily in Latin America, a country in Europe where if you don't go with your document that shows that you're the owner of the brand, you cannot

register a domain, and that's it, and you have to go and deliver it personally. So the registration policies may be more complex. They could be simplified and this would create many possibilities, and also, the operations registration processes, etc.

It's also important to talk about the relationship between the registries and registrants. Each ccTLD is an independent word. Country codes may be registrars or not, but if you use the channel of the registrars that are already ICANN-accredited, we should try and work with them because they have much more experience, they know how this works, they are working with large domains. They are going to give us the right advice, and it's worthwhile working with them. They will help us to sell and market our domain.

So first, we have strategies to develop sustainable growth of the domains. Number two, the second one is also very interesting. The idea of sharing resources. We have heard about three examples this morning of the benefits of sharing resources among TLDs. For example, through LACTLD, LACNIC, or various platforms. They are already there. We just have to use them.

Training and marketing and sales, technical issues, for example, technical training of the cert. We're talking about an earlier response center, so we can see there are various initiatives and actions coming up from the community, and especially for the smaller domains where they could use it. They could jump on the bandwagon and leverage what has already been done.

There could be other services that could be shared. For example, marketing campaign. Does it make sense to share marketing campaigns? Of course. Each country has its own features, and there is one-size-fit-all strategy, but maybe an idea could be shared and, after that, tailored to the local needs, and some projects could be shared even more farfetched.

Maybe the back office of several ccTLDs could be shared because, in the long run, it's just doing a copy and paste of a software. You buy more hardware, and if it's small domains, they shouldn't be too complicated, where these are just ideas.

Number one, strategies to facilitate sustainable growth of TLDs. Number two, sharing these resources. And the third one would be, okay, let's try to learn – nobody likes this – let's go into the zone. Let's try to see how our domain is used.

We may do service, see if we see people on the streets, count them, comparing them to the dot-com [inaudible] we may also do some research. We can do complete analysis of the zone. For example, analyzing all the domains in this zone and trying to find out whether there is something or not behind those domains, the server.

If there is a server, what name server it has how many servers. One, two, three, four, nineteen, or we may be getting some very interesting information. But after that, looking at the content. We could analyze the webs and, for example, geolocalizing there. Where are they located? Does this match the most common registrars? This may be an issue with countries that have connectivity problems.

Isn't the [inaudible] most important registrant is a country where there is no good connectivity or the route is longer? What happens if we have a problem with a cable?

We also talked about the content. Webpages. What do they deal with? How is our domain being used through dot-lat? Is it really used to sell services to the Latin American community or for example, dot tv? It isn't used by the island. It's used to sell TV-related products. So we could develop marketing campaigns. Maybe the domains are not being used the way they should be used. We may look at the number of pages we have in the parking area, how many are being resold if they belong to private users, or if they belong to companies. So we may learn a lot about our TLDs are being used just by looking at the content.

We may also find some other curiosities. For example, simple things, and this is quite easy to search for. For example, the length of a TLD, popular words within the TLD that might be useful for campaigns on the web. For example, there is a course on Facebook to find out what is the length of a TLD. So these are excuses to motivate your community, to have your community speak about your domain name. So this is all I wanted to mention, and I want to repeat the three points.

Strategies for a sustainable growth, the topic of the registration processes, policies, registrar, etc. to share and promote efforts for smaller registries to be able to grow quickly and to make the most of the potential that bigger registries have, and to have greater

knowledge of the use of our TLD. That is to say, to make the most of all the tools, computing tools, and statistics tools to see what the TLD thinks about that, as in what is the opinion of the TLD so that we can have better marketing campaign. Thank you.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

So in our previous break, we were speaking, and we found the lost chain. I will now introduce Oscar Robles. He's a specialist in domain names. He's our missing link, in fact. He was a co-founder of LACTLD some long ago, and now is the LACNIC CEO. So he's the exact and great intersection between the world of the names and between the worlds of the numbers, and he can provide a different perspective from this world. Oscar, you have the floor.

OSCAR ROBLES:

Well, I am the missing link, in fact, in the business domain name industry, in fact. Thank you very much for your presentation. I will speak about these topics that are related to the domain name system in the region, and I will speak about the challenges that we are facing in the region in terms of DNS, and of course the role that LACNIC plays in this issue.

First of all, I would like to give you a general outlook regarding the region. We have approximately 3.2 billion users in the world who are connected to Internet. So 10% out of these 3.2 billion users belong to Latin America, so they are Latin American users. And this percentage is still being kept at 10%, but the most interesting thing here is that

this year, we have a greater amount of Internet users in the Latin America in comparison with those in North America. That is to say, US and Canada.

This is for the first time in history. And, of course, this is something natural because there is a much greater population in this part of the world, and this was something that was going to happen in the end, but it is interesting to see that we are now experiencing and facing this situation. And this, of course, generates and favors certain business aspects because there are ISPs that are seeing the region as a relevant one, a homogenous region in certain aspects, not only in terms of language, but in terms of other aspects.

And the fact of having these solutions and this market is also interesting, because we can be the receptors of interesting solutions. So this is the context that we face. Now let's talk about the different challenges that we face, and we have business challenges, technological challenges, and political challenges.

When it comes to technical challenges, well, these are worldwide challenges. We cannot say that these challenges are exclusive for the region. In fact, these are global challenges. Interconnection in Latin America is starting to be resolved. It was a big effort. It was a great challenge for us as a region. We had to suffer the lack of connection. As someone said today in the morning, there was practically no interconnection among the countries in the region and this, of course, created costs that were very high to maintain Internet and to implement hosting solutions. So access was very expensive during

many years. This is now changing for many players but there is a change indeed.

Another challenge that we face in terms of DNS has to do with software. The main software being managed or used for the 80% of transactions in the DNS in the world for DNS queries is called BIND, and this is used, as I said before, by 80% of service in the world, and there is only one version of this software, or at least only one product, which is responsible for that 80% of the software used by the DNS.

And this is a challenge because it means that if there is a failure in the quality of the software or a boot, or any kind of problem in this application or in this system, well this, of course, will affect Internet. And I'm talking about a serious failure in the software.

So this was the main application for many years for DNS in the world. And of course, this is a challenge. There is approximately 100,000 DNS in the world and 80,000 DNS use the version of this software, so this is a challenge that we are facing. And, of course, we have to work together not only in Latin America.

Taking into account the DNS structure and the challenges in this regard, not long ago, perhaps 15 years ago, this was a scheme of Unicast or Anycast was developed so as to create capacities to use more instances or more domain name servers for one zone. Instead of having 13 due to the size of the package with Anycast, we could have unlimited number of instances taking into account the [carries] in each zone.

But, of course, in the region, we didn't have anyone offering the solution. Today, it might be natural to go to a [PCA] or go to VeriSign or to go to any other company and they will offer Anycast. But ten years ago, this was not the case. And some ccTLDs began working on that development. NIC Mexico was one of the partners working on the Anycast solution, and they were pioneers in that process.

Today I had with great hope that this LACTLD, that Anycast Cloud will have a significant impact and that will host all the ccTLDs or TLDs, if this is open to other players that might not be able to pay those solutions or that will have no access to business solutions, as I was mentioning before. So I believe this is going to be extended and this is going to be a solution for one of the challenges in our region.

Then we have the DNS observatory promoted by ICANN and implemented by NIC Chile and some other actors or players in the region. This is something interesting because it provides relevant information to the industry. And then, of course, we have the fine tuning for the industry and the DNS, as well.

The DNS in itself has its own challenge, which is the DNSSEC. We know that there are ten DNSSEC operators in the region. They have already signed the zone, and this, of course, provides more complexity to the zone and it adds more complexity to the management of the ccTLD.

Today, we do not have great amounts of domain names signed under those zones, but in the future, this will be more complex due to the amount of traffic that these carriers will generate because they

manage a different package size. Of course, it's the DNSSEC and the DNS do not have the same size in terms of packages.

Another topic, which is important to LACNIC, and it has been promoted by LACNIC, it is the topic of root servers. As you know, there are 13 root servers, none of them is in a region that is say there is no responsible entity in the region. However, there are different instances in the region due to the Anycast solution. There are more than 570 instances of this at the global level and about 50 are placed in the region, so this amounts to almost 10% to have. Or this represents our expectation of having 10% in any aspect. That is to say, a 10% invest solution.

So the 10% of having the 10% of the instances in this region is something that is being seen, and this is thanks to not only LACTLD but also to the players and TLDs that have promoted these instances and that have contributed to this infrastructure.

Now I will speak about the political challenges. These are quite simple. On one hand, authorities are more interested in us and what registries do, and what the ccTLDs and registries do, such as the case of LACNIC. And they have the intention of understanding what they or what we do and how we can provide information to them when required.

But sometimes, objectives are not that clear. The police, for example, have the intention of obtaining information, but sometimes they attribute this to very complex crimes, such child pornography. And taking this into account, well, we might move away from our

objective or move away from the child pornography crime. And of course, we want to contribute to solving these crimes, but sometimes this is only the pretext that we have or the excuse that we have.

Apparently, you can hear me very well. Sometimes it's just the excuse to get information, and being a registry in charge of that service, we have to be very careful because although we want to cooperate with law enforcement agencies, we also have a regulation to comply with the regulations related to privacy and personal data protection.

On the other hand, for over 30 years now, the DNS. So the DNS was admitted over 30 years ago when this system was defined, this distributed system was defined, and a new element was introduced to the Internet, the hierarchies. Up to that point, there were no hierarchies. It was just a network, a mesh where the only hierarchy was those who are inside and those who are not inside or are not part of it.

So there was no such hierarchy when the DNS was set up for the first time, the hierarchy-based model of domains was set up. Top-level domains, second-level, third-level domains and so on and so forth. It's amazing how this simple change created such a political discussion that goes on up to nowadays. And this is what at this ICANN meeting will be discussed throughout the day.

[Inaudible] IANA transition and wants the relevant elements. Here's the transferring of the stewardship role of IANA related to names, numbers, and protocols, but the issue of names was born in the DNS when DNS was given a hierarchical nature and there had to be

somebody who was responsible for managing the root of the whole domain name system, and this organization was naturally the US Government.

We expect this to change in this community or as soon as the ICG may submit the proposal to the US Government to go through a transition of the IANA stewardship responsibilities. This is the political challenge.

And finally, the business and marketing challenge is, I think, it's there when we have more areas of opportunity. We have about 10 million domains under the registries of the 230 million in the world. In the world, there are about 300 million domains registered under the TLDs and only 10 million are from Latin America. Dot-ar, dot-mx, dot-co, etc. And dot-lat, too.

So this is less than 3.4% of the total number, so we are very far from that 10% share we should have regarding TLDs. In the past we had 30 TLDs in the region, out 300 in the world. Out of the 260 ccTLDs, about 20 gTLDs and about 30 CC IDNs – that is the ccTLDs IDNs. And, well, it was just 10% of the total number of TLDs in the region, 3 out of 300. Now today, with the gTLDs, we are fewer than 4% in absolute terms when we talk about labels. How many labels we have in the region out of all the labels available in the world.

So let's now talk about gTLDs. There are open gTLDs. There are about – and I don't want to ignore anybody, but dot-lat is the open generic one in the region as compared to the 1,000 there may be in all. So I'm talking about the business arena and the gTLDs. In order to sell these

gTLDs, you need ICANN-accredited registrars. To only mention one of the obstacles to becoming an accredited registrar for those domains in 2013, I did a search and we had about a 2% share in the total number of ICANN-accredited registrars.

In the region in Latin America, we had 20 registrars out of the 1,000 accredited registrars. Today, it's only 1%, so in two years, our share dropped to 1% because the total number of registrars has grown, and also because some registrars from the region left the business.

If we talk about the market share of the registrars in the region, well, this is a very, very low figure. It's about 0.11% of the total number of the registries in the world. So, of course, it doesn't exist for practical purposes from the business point of view. This is a huge opportunity. What is LACNIC doing here? Well, I'd like to tell you something that may be you are not fully aware of. Despite the fact that I've been working for 20 years in this area, well working maybe too much, I've been enrolled in dot-mx for 20 years almost, and I've been close to dot LACNIC, I didn't it was an important actor in the DNS arena, but today, LACNIC with its infrastructure has almost received 150 million queries a day. This is about 10,000 queries to the DNSs per second.

As you know, IP registrars managed to reverse resolution of domains, so it also gives origin to many queries for IPV 4 and 6, and I would say this is larger or more than many TLDs in the region have. I don't have some data, but just, in my opinion, I would say that it's one of the largest operators in the DNS ecosystem. So we are very interested in this. We want to keep on working in the DNS arena, not only the

operational and technical areas, but also in the technology area, in the business area.

We cannot do that much in the business area but we want to work in order to create collaborative efforts in the Internet housed in Montevideo where all these organizations are working together. We also want to participate in these efforts. The goal would be, and this is my conclusion, to promote those local capabilities not only because we are nationalistic but because we want to have a larger share of the business services, a larger share of involvement in the technology area. We want to keep that 10%. We want to grow hand in hand, and we want to match what we provide and we sell with the number of [futures] we have in this part of the world. Thank you very much.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

We have just a few minutes so that you may shoot your questions at the members of the panel. Feel free to ask questions. Usually, you don't find such a wide array of people with different opinions and views of the DNS arena. If you are too shy, I will ask the first question.

Tony, could you help us think about the path to follow so that the figures you mentioned about market share would change when we talk about gTLDs in the region? What could we do to grow these numbers, of course, after learning about your concrete and hard experience? Do you think there is a way of overcoming all these issues?

TONY HARRIS:

I believe there is a way. First of all, we should look at the access conditions. As I told you earlier on, they are sort of far-fetched or beyond the possibilities of organizations in our region. And, on the other hand, I think we should work – I may diverge from the issue, talking about IP numbers, which is a very important subject because at LACNIC, we are talking about the availability of IPv4 numbers.

In Argentina, there is very [inaudible] such as intern and GE, and there have been applications for the Internet of Things, especially for health care area, and they will be launched very soon, and infrastructure is not ready for this to manage the IPv6 protocol, generally speaking, and this should be borne in mind.

Sorry that I took the mic to mention this, but in the region, we're working on the development of this, and it would be really a shame if we don't move forward because of this. On the other hand, I think that the involvement of the community that is present here, and which attends all ICANN meeting is pushing or driving consistently so as to get better results, such as the ones you have mentioned.

GABRIEL BRENTA:

Do you think it will be possible to relate the new gTLDs with existing ccTLDs that will somehow guarantee the operational aspects, and this is what we had at dot-lat, for example? Is it a question for me?

TONY HARRIS: May I refer this question to expert? Who is the expert? He's my partner in dot-lat.

ERNESTO BOJORQUEZ: I believe it would be useful. It is an opportunity for managing the costs and the infrastructure, which TLDs already have, to operate other TLDs. So I believe it would be useful and the more consolidation you get, the larger the opportunity becomes. However, that is our [problem] in the region. As Oscar was saying, many of the new initiatives are not based in our region, so it gets harder to achieve such consolidation.

GABRIEL BRENTA: Is there any additional question? There is a question in the back. Please shout and I will do the simultaneous Spanish/Spanish translation.

[AUGUSTINE]: I'm [Augustine] [inaudible] and this is a question. Well, you talked about the business, about the entry barriers, but nothing was said about the exit barriers. Something was said about closing a registrant or a registry, so once you are business and you have some domains registered, have you thought about this exit registry? It's not so easy to remove a domain. I'm talking about the outgoing barriers.

EDUARDO SANTOYO: Registries, when they get a registry, you're already paying for some things, which guarantee there is a smooth transition in the case you exit the business. So you may consider this as one of the barriers for entry because, from the very beginning, you have to guarantee that smooth exit even though you may never use it.

And not only somebody else says you not only have to guarantee it, but you also have to pay for it, fund it. So it's an entry barrier.

TONY HARRIS: I talked about the letter of credit of about \$140,000. When you become a registry to operate a new gTLD, that money is available for ICANN to appoint somebody who will take the place of this registry if it leaves the business. I don't know what happens if a registrar leaves the business. Maybe somebody knows how this works.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: ICANN can ask the registrar to move the domains from the registrar, but if this is not possible, ICANN is going to issue a request to all registrars in the world so that they will submit this request to take up all the domains that were under that first registrar who wanted to leave the business. Usually, ICANN takes into account the region where the registrar is. If it is a registrar from Mexico, it's going to try and find a registrar of Mexico and of a neighboring country to take up those domains.

If it's a registrar from China, a registrar from China is not going to take up the domains of a registrar of Colombia. It might happen but it's

unlikely. And registrars, well, we all are able to ask, we may be asked to do this, to take up the TLDs of other registrars but without paying. And this has already happened 20 or 30 times in the last five or six years.

GABRIEL BRENTA: Is there any other question? If there are no further questions, we thank all the members of the panel for their time, for sharing their knowledge with us.

CAROLINA AGUERRE: Thank you very much to all of you, and now we'll have a coffee break. Coffee is already served in the back and we will reconvene at 4:00 as to have open mic questions and to take up any other pending issues. Thank you very much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]